



**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter  
101 Eighth Street  
Oakland, CA 94607-4700  
TEL 510.817.5700  
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769  
FAX 510.817.5848  
E-MAIL [info@mtc.ca.gov](mailto:info@mtc.ca.gov)  
WEB [www.mtc.ca.gov](http://www.mtc.ca.gov)

*Scott Haggerty, Chair*  
Alameda County

*Adrienne J. Tissier, Vice Chair*  
San Mateo County

*Tom Azumbrado*  
U.S. Department of Housing  
and Urban Development

*Tom Bates*  
Cities of Alameda County

*Dean J. Chu*  
Cities of Santa Clara County

*Dave Cortese*  
Association of Bay Area Governments

*Chris Daly*  
City and County of San Francisco

*Bill Dodd*  
Napa County and Cities

*Dorene M. Giacopini*  
U.S. Department of Transportation

*Federal D. Glover*  
Contra Costa County

*Anne W. Halsted*  
San Francisco Bay Conservation  
and Development Commission

*Steve Kinsey*  
Marin County and Cities

*Sue Lempert*  
Cities of San Mateo County

*Jake Mackenzie*  
Sonoma County and Cities

*Jon Rubin*  
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

*Bijan Sartipi*  
State Business, Transportation  
and Housing Agency

*James P. Spering*  
Solano County and Cities

*Amy Worth*  
Cities of Contra Costa County

*Ken Yeager*  
Santa Clara County

*Steve Heminger*  
Executive Director

*Ann Flemer*  
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

*Andrew B. Fremier*  
Deputy Executive Director,  
Bay Area Toll Authority

*Therese W. McMillan*  
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

**PLANNING COMMITTEE  
MEETING OF JULY 10, 2009  
MINUTES**

**ATTENDANCE**

Commissioner Spering called the Planning Committee meeting to order at 9:31 a.m. Other members in attendance were Commissioners Azumbrado, Chu, Giacopini, Haggerty, Halsted, Lempert, MacKenzie, Rein-Worth, Rubin, and Tissier. Commissioners Bates and Daly also attended.

**CONSENT CALENDAR: Minutes of June 12, 2009**

Commissioner Mackenzie moved approval, Commissioner Lempert seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

**BAY AREA 2009 CLEAN AIR PLAN: Draft Transportation Control Measures (TCMs)**

Ms. Liz Brisson stated that MTC staff, in collaboration with the BAAQMD and ABAG staff, takes the lead role in developing the TCMs. Staff has reviewed the State TCMs from the 2005 Ozone Strategy and propose to carry forward a majority of these TCMs, with some modifications, as well as add new TCMs to reflect policy and investment commitments made in the Transportation 2035 Plan. She noted that staff is proposing 17 TCMs that aim to improve transit service, improve system efficiency, encourage sustainable travel behavior, support focused growth, and implement pricing strategies. Each TCM narrative includes the following components: 1) purpose, description and background context; 2) specific implementation actions and costs for analysis years 2012 and 2020; 3) quantified emission reductions, emission trade-offs and co-benefits, and cost-effectiveness in terms of cost per ton of ozone precursor reduced; 4) potential implementing agencies; and 5) method for monitoring the implementation progress of each TCM.

MTC and BAAQMD staffs are working together to calculate the emission reduction estimates and cost-effectiveness for each TCM. Further, BAAQMD staff will apply a multi-pollutant evaluation method that will estimate the health and climate protection benefits as well as the benefit-cost ratios for each TCM, stationary and area source, and mobile source control measure identified in the Clean Air Plan (CAP). The results of these analyses will be included in the Draft Control Strategy for the 2009 CAP that the BAAQMD expects to release in late July 2009 for public review.

In conclusion, Ms. Brisson recommended that this Committee approve releasing the Draft TCMs as described for public review so that MTC and Air District staffs can move forward with the emission analyses and air quality cost-effectiveness assessments.

Commissioner Sperling asked how staff measures Safe Routes to Schools and Safe Routes to Transit program travel impacts. Ms. Brisson stated that staff has performed a literature review of existing studies examining the travel impacts of these types of programs. A program evaluation of the State of California's Safe Routes to School program has included before and after studies at certain schools that implemented improvements, reporting increases in walk trips and bike trips. She noted that there is less empirical research available for Safe Routes to Transit because there is no comparable State program. Commissioner Sperling requested staff to send him what information they have.

Mr. David Burch, BAAQMD, stated that there is an element in TCM C-4 about trying to reduce high speed driving and encourage smart driving which is a promising area for cost effective emission reductions. There is a possibility that staff might decide to break that out as a separate TCM. He also stated that the draft control strategy is still a work in progress, and will be coming back to the Planning Committee as a part of the draft Clean Air Plan in the fall.

Commissioner Mackenzie moved approval of the staff recommendation to release the Draft TCMs for public review. Commissioner Lempert seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

#### **PRELIMINARY TLC PROGRAM RECOMMENDATIONS**

Mr. Doug Johnson provided background information on the TLC Program. He stated that the TLC Program Evaluation began in the summer of 2007. Evaluation findings were presented to the Planning Committee in April 2008. Reconnecting America's Center for Transit Oriented Development (CTOD) completed the TOD financing white paper in August 2008, and the White paper findings were presented to the Planning Committee, and CMA staff in September 2008.

Mr. Ken Kirkey summarized the staff recommendations for program changes, which are: 1) Only projects in planned or potential PDAs will be eligible for TLC funds; 2) Increase grant awards from the current \$500,000 - \$3 million to a maximum of \$6 million; no grant minimum; 3) Expand eligibility to include categories listed in Attachment A; select highest impact projects, based on intensity of development, proximity to transit service, and local needs; selection dependent on project eligibility for funds and/or funding exchanges; and 4) Administer 2/3 of the program regionally by MTC and 1/3 by CMAs (same as current structure); Fold HIP program into elements of new TLC capital program, fold TLC Planning into Station Area Planning program, and create a new technical assistance program for TOD

Mr. Johnson noted that the Transportation 2035 Plan recommended a doubling of the current TLC program (about \$27 million/year to about \$60 million/year annualized over the life of the plan) including both Surface Transportation Program/Congestion Mitigation Air Quality (STP/CMAQ) funds and anticipated, unspecified new revenues. Actual TLC funding levels will be determined by federal STP/CMAQ Cycle programming policies to be adopted by the Commission later this year.

In closing, Mr. Johnson stated that staff will continue to discuss these proposals with MTC's advisory committees and partner agencies. Staff intends to have final guidelines approved by

October/November 2009 to solicit projects for Cycle 1 federal funding by the end of this calendar year.

Commissioner Sprering called for public comment.

- Mike Moore, City of Mill Valley Planning Director, expressed his support for the staff recommendation, particularly related to tying the program to the FOCUS program, increasing the grant size, and allowing some flexibility on how the grants are used.
- Kathleen Livermore, City of San Leandro, expressed her support for the staff recommendation, and stated that the City of San Leandro encourages MTC to prioritize the TLC funding for PDAs in communities that have taken the time to commit to planning for sustainable development. She also encourages the flexibility in the use of funds.
- John Raham, City of San Francisco, expressed his support for the recently adopted T2035 that calls for the TLC Program funding with a level up to \$60m per year, and encouraged MTC to devote that funding to the TLC Program and to allow a larger maximum grant award and more flexibility
- Rich Hedges expressed his support on the staff recommendation and stated that the Elderly and Disabled Committee's Land Use Transportation Sub-Committee is working on a proposal for changes to TLC, that will be brought to the Commission in September. He also stated that the Advisory Council is moving towards supporting the larger grants.
- Ms. Carli Paine, TransForm, stated that land use along with pricing is the most effective way to move the needle on greenhouse gas emissions, vehicle miles traveled, and also provide significant benefits on safety and other issues. She noted that MTC needs to do everything it can to fully fund the program at the highest level possible early on.
- Kate White, Urban Land Institute, urged the committee to support the staff recommendations for improvements to the program as well as increasing the dollar amounts.

Commissioner Lempert expressed her concern about using TLC money for parking lots, which often get in the way of the accessibility to the transit stations. She stated that staff needs to encourage people to either take shuttles to transit, carpool, ride bikes, or walk.

Commissioner Mackenzie expressed his support of the staff recommendations.

Committee Haggerty commented on the program option for funding streetscapes, and stated that some of those need to be the responsibility of the developer, and not pull money away from other TLC projects.

Commissioner Rein-Worth suggested that staff look at those land use elements that are in SB 375 to ensure consistency with the TLC program.

Commissioner Chu questioned the rationale of the 1/3 – 2/3 split and stated that he would like to see a 50/50 split for CMA and MTC programs.

Commissioner Bates also expressed his support of the staff recommendations.

Commissioner Halsted said that she is pleased that the program contains some flexibility, and hopes it will contain flexibility for non-transportation infrastructure, if necessary. She also suggested that staff find a way to limit funding for parking lots.

Commissioner Tissier commented on technical assistance program for TODs, and stated that it is important to work with the Planning Directors to make sure that plans for TODs fully consider accessibility for both the disabled and for the aging population.

Commissioner Sperling suggested that MTC should not completely eliminate investments in parking, and suggested a change in the wording from parking garage to parking facility. He also recommended that funding exchanges be emphasized so that we capture the full investment on each project.

**OTHER BUSINESS/PUBLIC COMMENT**

There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 10:50 a.m. The Committee's next meeting is scheduled for Friday, September 11, 2009 at 9:30 a.m. in the Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium, Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter, Oakland, CA.